

KALAMAZOO HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Agenda – TUESDAY, December 21, 2021

5:00 pm

VIRTUAL MEETING

241 W. South St. Kalamazoo, MI 49007

I. Call to Order: Mr. Berg called the meeting to order at 5:01 PM

II. Approval of Absences:

Eric Stucky-Absent	Andrew Grayson-Kalamazoo
Dana Underwood – Kalamazoo	Jeremy Berg- Kalamazoo
John Mitchell-Kalamazoo	Vacant
Dan Kastner-Kalamazoo	

III. Approval of Agenda: Motion made by Mr. Mitchell to approve with a second by Ms. Underwood. All commissioners approve

IV. Introduction of Guests: Luis Pena- New Historic Coordinator

V. Public Comment on non-agenda items: None

VI. Disclaimer: Ms. Ferraro read the disclaimer into record. 5:03 PM

VII. HEARINGS - OLD BUINESS:

A) 202 Allen Blvd	5:05pm	Owner: Joshua Meints
Style: Craftsman		Applicant: Character Exteriors-Collin
Zone: RM-15		Built: 1910
		Owned Since: 11/18/2020

1). Install Everlast composite horizontal siding on the sides of the roof dormers instead of the original stucco. HDC must make decision unless applicant withdraws. Postponed from 11/16/21 at applicant's request.

PPZ21-0014

Mr. Winfrey is with Character Exteriors representing the owners at 202 Allen Blvd. The homeowner is looking to install Everlast composite horizontal siding on the sides of the roof dormers instead of the original stucco. This material is recently being used in two very historic areas in the United States such as Salem, Massachusetts and Mackinaw Island in Michigan which are two of the most history areas in the US. The benefits are the material doesn't need paint or need ongoing maintenance especially on a very limited access area. The material will replicate a wood cedar siding profile and no caulking needed.

Ms. Ferraro states that the stucco on this house hasn't been painted. She also states she couldn't find how this material reacts with snow and how it performs. Ms. Ferraro's second concern is that this will require the corner boards in such a small space. This product has only been in production for 12 years.

Mr. Winfrey states that the website for this product is 100% waterproof and could be submerged for 100 years and would still hold up to the elements. The benefit with the trim is with the profile it can be used with a composite PVC corner option. Can use different materials to corner the dormers. The options on the website are 3 inches wide then it won't show any siding. Can do something that is more specific to the project so it will require less maintenance. Ms. Ferraro states that the stucco didn't require any maintenance or painting for the first century.

Mr. Berg is curious as to what is going on with the front of the house Ms. Ferraro states it has looks like this since about the 80's.

Mr. Mitchell thinks the stucco was damaged on the dormers probably when the roof was re-done. The stucco has deteriorated on many parts of the house especially on the dormers.

Ms. Underwood is not convinced why they can't just re-stucco the area. Mr. Winfrey is sure this can be achieved but was looking at an alternative option that fits the standards.

Ms. Ferraro does want to let the homeowner know that doing this would affect the tax credit available to them. Tax credit works all or nothing. If they do the Everlast on the dormers it could affect all the other work, they have done on the house like the furnace and roof that's been done or any other work they plan to do. Could be a better investment for them to do the stucco since they could lose 25% of there investment.

Mr. Mitchel isn't opposed to new projects but with the horizontal look and the corner boards doesn't look like the original look to the house. This would totally change the look of the home. Mr. Berg agrees and feels like this will totally change the look of the house and doesn't feel this is the right house to try this one.

Mr. Kastner also feels that the repairs could be done with stucco and would like to see it done in the original material.

No public comments currently.

Ms. Underwood moves to deny the application, based on Secretary of the Interior Standards #2, #5 and #6 with a 2nd by Mr. Mitchell. Roll call with all commissioners agree to deny.

VIII. NEW BUSINESS:

B) 615 Potter

5:25pm

Owner: Teddy Reinbold

Applicant: Owner

Style: Craftsman Foursquare

Built: 1904

Zone: RM-36

Owned Since: 11/02/2015

1). Violation – Replaced three original windows on the north side of the first floor.

2). Add wooden framed screens over the existing replacement windows.

EN21-5428 & PPZ21-0016 Violation Application

Mr. Reinbold installed replacement windows at the home. He contacted Ms. Ferraro to come up with another solution to install wood framed screens. Ms. Ferraro states that windows were replaced with vinyl windows without approval. She is unsure what the condition of the original windows were before they were removed as they did not have site visit. Ms. Ferraro suggested the wood frame screen and would hide the fact that it is a vinyl window rather than replace the windows. If any more windows are replaced, they will need to be approved by the commission. The condition of the windows is key when determining what happens.

Mr. Berg is curious as to why the window farthest to the left isn't asymmetrical, but this window is considered and picture window. The window that was previously installed was the same and did not open.

Ms. Underwood's issue is if this had come to the committee then the commission wouldn't have approved it. Vinyl windows aren't allowed in the Historic District per the districts policy. Mr. Reinbold is new to the Historic process and was unaware that this was needed, and, in the future, he will make sure to follow the correct process.

Mr. Mitchell does agree with Ms. Underwood but after seeing how the windows are in the house, he doesn't feel that it sticks out that they are vinyl and if the wood screens are put in that he feels that it would be ok.

No public comment currently.

Mr. Mitchell makes motion to approve with a "**Notice to Proceed**" for this project as presented. Wooden screens are to be made for 3 first floor north windows, mounted on the blind stop, with a divider bar on the screen that lines up with the meeting rail on the window. Approval of any final details to be delegated to the historic preservation coordinator with a second from Mr. Grayson. Roll call all commissioners approve.

C) 501 Douglas	5:45 pm	Owner: Pauline West LLC
Style – Craftsman Foursquare		Applicant: KNHS-Takunia Collins
Zone: RD-19		Built: 1904
		Owned Since: 11/02/2015

- 1). Upper sashes remain-fix in place. Lower sashes replaced with appropriate replicas
- 2). Replace the entire window (both sashes and all stops) with new wooden windows in a sash pack with upper sashes that replicate the ribbon windows with exterior false muntin. Existing exterior casing would remain unchanged.

PPZ21-0017 New Application

Mr. Collins is here on behalf of Pauline West. Mr. Collins is the lead hazard control manager with KNHS. The house at 501 Douglas does have lead-based paint and had to have a child removed from the home due to the hazard. The first proposal to fix the upper sashed and have them remain and will be

fixed in place and the lower sashes replaced with appropriate replicas. The most expensive 2nd proposal was to replace the entire window (both sash and all stops) with new wooden windows with upper sashes that replicate the ribbon windows. The existing exterior casing would remain unchanged. Normally the sash packs are not visible from the exterior. The exterior of the home will be repainted. The exterior casing will be encapsulated to ensure safety. The main concern is removing the lead-based paint.

Ms. Ferraro is concerned if the current windows could be stored in the house for the next owner. The windows will not be able to be stored in the house due safety and lack of space. The porch windows are not a lead hazard so will not be replaced but will be repainted.

No public comment currently.

The windows will be able to be relocated out of the house for possibility of being rebuilt.

Mr. Mitchell makes motion to approve the work as specified: in each opening, replace the entire window (both sashes and all stops) with new wooden window sash packs with upper sashes that replicate the ribbon windows and have exterior false muntin's. Existing exterior casing would remain unchanged. This proposal complies with the Secretary of the Interior Standard #6. The commission approves a Certificate of Appropriateness for this project. Approval of any final details to be delegated to the historic preservation coordinator with a second by Mr. Grayson. Roll call with all commissioners approve.

IX. Approval of Minutes: November 16, 2021 (ITEM F) – Motion made and approved by Ms. Underwood and second by Mr. Kastner with all commissioner's approval.

X. Administrative approvals - November 10, 2021 to December 14, 2021

a) No building permit required – 2

Woodward	303	Replace/repair existing greenhouse window to match
Allen Blvd	214	Fence and gutters

b) Building permit required – 6

Grand	1213	Roof and misc. repairs
Vine Pl	820	Roof
Vine Pl	824	Roof
Dutton W	410	Roof
Walnut W	303	Roof
Elmwood	823	Repair west side porch

XI. Other Business-

- a) Consider whether to stream HDC Meetings live: All commissioners approve to livestream.
- b) Proposal for HDC training retreat: Possibly in February to show samples.
- c) Retirement part for Sharon Ferraro, Thursday, January 6th, 2022 5-7pm at First Baptist Church across from Michigan News.

XII. Adjournment

Motion made to adjourn meeting by Mr. Mitchell with a second by Mr. Berg with all commissioners approve. Meeting adjourned at 6:22 pm.

_____	_____
Chairperson	Date
_____	_____
Historic Preservation Coordinator	Date
_____	_____
Recording secretary	Date

