

Tentative Agenda
Kalamazoo City Planning Commission
November 5, 2015
Regular Meeting

City Commission Chambers, 2nd Floor, City Hall

7:00 p.m.

-
- A. Call to Order
 - B. Roll Call
 - C. Adoption of Formal Agenda
 - D. Approval of Minutes (October 1, 2015)
 - E. Communications and Announcements
 - F. Public Hearings:
 - 1. P.C. #2015.04: Consideration of a request from the Community Planning and Development Department for a text amendment to Chapters 3.7, 4.1, 8.3.D., and 12.3 of the Zoning Ordinance pertaining to proposed Outdoor Sports/Recreation Lighting and Noise Regulations. **[Recommendation: motion to recommend approval of the text amendment to the City Commission.]**
 - G. Citizens' Comments Regarding Non-Agenda Items
 - H. Unfinished Business
(Citizens' comments are welcome before each item is voted upon by the Planning Commission)
 - 1. Strategic/Master Plan project update
 - I. New Business
(Citizens' comments are welcome before each item is voted upon by the Planning Commission)
 - J. Citizens' Comments
 - K. City Planner's Report
 - L. Miscellaneous Comments by Planning Commissioners
 - M. Adjournment

City of Kalamazoo
PLANNING COMMISSION
Minutes
October 1, 2015
DRAFT

Second Floor, City Hall
City Commission Chambers
241W. South Street, Kalamazoo, MI 49007

Members Present: Rachel Hughes-Nilsson, Chair; Charley Coss, Vice-Chair; Geoffrey Cripe, Emily Greenman Wright, Tracy Hall, Susan McBain, Derek Wissner

Members Excused: Joshua Cook, Rico White

City Staff: Rebekah Kik, City Planner; Rob Bauckham, Senior Development Planner; Wendee Mayes, Recording Secretary

Guests: None

A. CALL TO ORDER

Commissioner Hughes-Nilsson called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m.

B. ROLL CALL

Planner Kik proceeded with roll call and determined that the aforementioned members were present.

C. ADOPTION OF FORMAL AGENDA

Commissioner Wissner supported by Commissioner Greenman Wright, moved approval of the October 1, 2015 Planning Commission agenda as presented. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

D. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Commissioner Hall, supported by Commissioner Greenman Wright, moved approval of the September 3, 2015 Planning Commission minutes as presented. With a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

E. COMMUNICATIONS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

None

F. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

G. CITIZENS' COMMENTS (Regarding non-agenda items)

None

H. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Planner Kik presented an orientation of Imagine Kalamazoo Master Plan update for the commissioners. The last time the Master Plan was updated was in 2010. Master Plans are written for 10 years, we will revisit our efforts in 2025. A large part of this update is getting public input to ensure that the Master Plan will be a guide to what the community wants as well as a direction for the City to go forward. The goal to engage the public is going to include a variety of outreach campaigns.

Imagine Kalamazoo 2025 is a comprehensive strategic framework to help all stakeholders (community groups, philanthropy, business entities, economic developers, government, investors and more) make decisions around a shared vision that improves the quality of life in Kalamazoo. Considering Kalamazoo's future there is a need to see many different points of view; including but not limited to land use, economic growth, neighborhood vision and vacant land and buildings. To do this well civic engagement needs to be a part of this process.

Imagine Kalamazoo 2025 involves workgroup partnerships that blend technical and community expertise. Planning Commission is being asked to be part of these workgroups. Commissioners (who have already volunteered for different topics) will be asked to advise staff and consultants, by considering public input and providing direction, reviewing the draft plans, championing the project, by helping to spread the work and build excitement.

Imagine Kalamazoo 2025 is made up of three documents:

- Strategic Vision is a ten year document which acts as the city's compass.
- Master Plan is a guide for the city's physical form.
- Zoning Ordinance is the implementation of the plan.

Planner Bauckham presented an update on the Outdoor Sports/Recreation Lighting Ordinance. There were meetings held in September with Oakland Drive and Winchell neighborhoods as well as a second community wide meeting. The citizen committee is continuing to meet to go over the draft of the documents and public comments to make revisions for a final draft form. There is an upcoming meeting for Stuart neighborhood on October 13th and a third community wide meeting on October 22nd. Plan is to present the final draft to the Planning Commission at November meeting with a public hearing. Balancing the institutions and community needs has been a challenge and hope that the final draft compromises for both sides. If the Planning Commission supports the final draft, it will be taken to the City Commission's first meeting in December for the first reading and then again in the second meeting in December. This is to meet the goal of having the ordinance in place by January 2016.

The draft changes include:

Dropping the entertainment portion of this ordinance and handle that as a separate ordinance in the future

- ❖ 11 a) Recommend dropping the 0.1 foot candles to 0.05 candles
- ❖ 11 b) Change the verbiage from mentioning a specific year to read most current lighting standards
- ❖ 11 c) Adding a total length of pole
- ❖ 11 d) Addressing the timing of lights and requiring all system to include a recording system of the timing for the lights; this will be used as a tool for verification of the usage of the lights
- ❖ 11 e) Breaking out the use table by zone
 - Covering the rental and third party use

- ❖ 11 f) Add shall be consistent with the most current standards
- ❖ 11 g) In place of a yearly use schedule for the lights, the City would ask for a quarterly use schedule
 - Ask for an annual report of the actual use
- ❖ 11 h) To control the noise levels utilizing the most advanced technology available
 - Noise complaints can require a noise study be done
 - No additional sound systems will be allowed
- ❖ 11 i) Violations (within a 12 month period) will be handled as follows
 - First violation – warning letter from the City Planner
 - Second violation – a second warning letter and may reduce the number of uses allowed
 - Third violation – City Planner could bring before Planning Commission who could suspend use for six to twelve months
- ❖ 11 j) Applications will be required; including photometric plans, noise studies, types of activities, methods to reduce glare and light spill and a formal site plan for review.

A draft will be sent to the Planning Commission for review before the November meeting.

Commissioner Wissner inquired as to the main argument against the ordinance. Planner Bauckham replied that some are for no lights at all, while neighbors of the Kalamazoo College football field don't mind some of the activity as it is now but are worried about the noise and lights after the ordinance passes. Others wanted the lights out fairly early and some don't want anything within a mile of their house. Planner Kik suggested looking at the table in the ordinance which breaks out the difference between practices and games. This is a direct result of some of the concerns from the neighbors. A very large part of the concerns are based around the noise that is anticipated by the neighborhoods. Planner Bauckham stated that throughout this process issues during the day were brought up and they had to be reminded that this ordinance is about night events and light uses only.

Commissioner Cripe mentioned that the proposal hits on a lot of the concerns as old as 2012 and these changes are awesome. It is provisioning the latest technology which will keep the ordinance from becoming outdated. People are concerned with the quality of life impact more than just the light and noise. The whole neighborhood is impacted and he is happy with the outcome of the draft. Planner Bauckham reminded the commission that the 2012 ordinance stated that if this new ordinance is not in place by the end of 2015, Kalamazoo College will be allowed to have 20 uses a year. Studies have been done that concluded this will not have any effect on the property value.

Commissioner Coss asked about violation section, he felt that it was close ended with the only choices if something comes before the Planning Commission being to suspend or revoke the permit. Maybe it could read that City Staff can come with a recommendation for the Planning Commission to adopt. He is looking for more flexibility if something is brought before the Planning Commission. Planner Bauckham responded that the penalty should reflect the degree of the violation. Bringing a violation before the Planning Commission will be a final act because of a blatant disregard of the ordinance. Conditions can be added to a special use permit at the time of application if need be. Planner Kik added that the violations reset every twelve months. A violation would only be brought before the Planning Commission if it was a third violation within a twelve month period. The community felt strongly about the ordinance enforcing on violations. Administrative enforcement procedure will outline the differences between major and minor violations. Commissioner Cripe added that he could see the citizens using three strikes you're out approach and trying to get people shut down with complaints. Planner Bauckham stated the administrative enforcement will be a separate document from the ordinance and it would state what was considered a minor compared to a major violation. Because it is a separate document it would not need to come before the committee to be updated. For any violations to be brought before the

Planning Commission it will have to be fairly severe as that is the only way to revoke a special use permit. The hope is for the first and second violations done administratively (fining and suspensions) would stop the violations and that it will not get to the point of a third violation.

Planner Bauckham asked commissioners to read final draft and contact city staff about any concerns they might have. Planner Kik also told commissioners that they are welcome to attend the community meetings that will be held in October.

I. NEW BUSINESS

Bronson Park Master Plan was presented by Sandra Bliesener of OCBA landscape architects on behalf of Sean Fletcher director of Kalamazoo City Parks and Recreation. The process of developing a Bronson Park Master Plan started just over a year ago and the final draft was presented to Parks and Recreation in July. There was a roughly 20 member steering committee that met monthly; these meetings were open to the public. There were also focus groups with representation from many other groups and held a public input meeting in January.

First, was to conduct a cultural landscape assessment to evaluate the significance of the existing park features. Also taking into account the requirements of the Secretary of Interior standards for historic property. The park was determined significant not only to the city residents but also to the historic groups from before the founding of the city. The overall park design has not changed much since the 1940s.

The recommendation that came from the assessment was that the park design should follow the guidelines of the Secretary of the Interior's rehabilitation standard. The steering committee supported this and there was very little dissent from the participants throughout the process. There is a lengthy report from OCBA in regards to the process, the history of the park and the cultural landscape assessment at <http://www.kalamazoocity.org/bronson-park-master-plan>.

Very little change will be done to the pavement in the park. The entire fountain complex and reflecting pool is intact other than some restoration. Fundraising is underway for the restoration work. The stage will stay where it is currently located. The biggest change is that there are 17 monuments currently scattered around the park and the plan addresses creating some areas on the edge of the park to organize the monuments and markers with walking paths along with some flower beds. The children's sculpture from 1976 (to commemorate the bicentennial) will be moved to another location closer to the street. There will be some flower beds left within the park and not just along the outside edges. The evergreen tree is to be relocated to the east end of the park. Mike the Topiary Peacock is being moved over to make room for the children. Two locations have been set aside for temporary ice skating and future sculptures (temporary and/or permanent). The Master Plan also addresses the future decisions on sculptures to be added to the park. The furniture that is currently in the park really does not fit the character of the park and there is talk of replacing the furniture and adding a few tables to try and make it a more active space. Kiosks will be placed at the northeast, southeast and southwest corners of the park for details on activities going on in the park and on the stage, for information about the park, a map of the park, etc. Over by the stage, there is a desire to have a better seating including a shade structure. Master Plan proposes a shaped structure however the Secretary of Interior Standards still needs to give approval.

Commissioner Hall asked what the timeline for this project is. Ms. Bliesener does not have a concrete timeline; the first step is to see how quickly the money for the project can be raised. Planner Kik stated that the city manager's office has just approved a fundraising consultant to help identify grants and

foundations that can support the work. The biggest constraint is with the historic part of the park. Parks and Recreation is going to be presenting to the City Commission to have a plan formally adopted at the October 19, 2015 meeting. After that approval fundraising can begin. Commissioner Greenman Wright asked if there will continue to be picnic tables. Ms. Bliesener answered that the picnic tables will still be there as well as more seating, however this has not been finalized yet. A drawing of the proposed park can be found at <http://ocba.com/portfolio-items/bronson-park-master-plan/?portfolioID=8>.

J. CITIZENS' COMMENTS

None

K. CITY PLANNER'S REPORT

Planner Bauckham reported that there are currently 45 site plan projects for 2015. This is right on goal for the year.

Project updates were as follows:

- Americana Estates is putting in a new building
- Borgess Gardens is putting up a new building
- A new building for the jail
- A site plan for another distillery on East Michigan Ave
- Depot building next to the craft brow building is being redone with a new addition. Likely will have a new restaurant and offices
- Kalamazoo College has broken ground on the new fitness center
- CVS pharmacy on Howard and West Michigan is about to break ground
- Milwood Elementary School has the old building basically down and some construction will start this year
- Harold Zeigler Auto front building addition is coming along
- New hanger project out at airport, south of the Air Zoo
- Sawall Health Foods is coming along and hope to be done by the end of the year

L. MISCELLANEOUS COMMENTS BY PLANNING COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Hughes-Nilsson extended a thank you to City Staff for the organization of the retreat. It was educational as well as fun. Commissioner Cripe stated that the retreat was the best ever. Commissioner Greenman Wright invited the commissioners to join the Furnace Fest on October 9, 2015 to support Community Homeworks. Planner Kik asked if they were still accepting donations for their auction. Commissioner Greenman Wright suggested contacting Community Homeworks Christina about donations.

M. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:28 p.m.



Planning Commission Staff Report

City of Kalamazoo

Project Address: City of Kalamazoo

Case #: P.C. 2015.04

Request: Text amendment for outdoor sports/recreation lighting and noise regulations

Meeting Date: November 5, 2015

Applicant: Community Planning & Development Department

Owner: N/A

Public Hearing: Yes

Date Legal Ad Published: October 21, 2015

Project Summary:

The Community Planning & Development Department (CP&D) is requesting approval of a text amendment to Sections 12.3, 3.7, 4.1, and 8.3.D. of the Zoning Ordinance to add outdoor sports/recreation lighting and noise regulations.

Recommendation:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission recommend to the City Commission to approve the proposed text amendment.

Community Planning & Development Department

415 Stockbridge Avenue
Kalamazoo, MI 49001
(269) 337-8044
(269) 337-8513 [fax]
www.kalamazoocity.org

Staff Contact Information:

Rebekah Kik, City Planner
Robert Bauckham, AICP, Senior Development Planner

ANALYSIS

Background:

Prior to 2012, the entire campus for Kalamazoo College was residentially-zoned. College/school facilities and uses are not permitted by right in the residential zoning districts in the city. That meant that every time Kalamazoo College desired to construct a new building or expand one of its existing facilities, a variance was required through the Zoning Board of Appeals. Similarly, the property for Kalamazoo Christian High School, also residentially-zoned, applied for a variance in 2009. The request from Kalamazoo Christian was to request to add lights to the football field. The variance was denied. The rationale for the denial was that the field is very close to the adjacent residential neighborhood, and adding lights for night time use would be detrimental to the residents.

The Institutional Campus (IC) zone is intended to be used for college campuses along with other school, hospital, and large church properties. A campus master plan for the institution must be created or an existing plan updated as part of the rezoning process, which identifies future development projects to be undertaken over the next 10-year period. With the IC zone and campus master plan in place, new buildings and facility expansions are permitted by right and a variance is not required. Kalamazoo College has maintained a campus master plan for many years.

In 2012, Kalamazoo College applied to have all property on the campus rezoned to the IC zone. At the same time, the school updated their campus master plan to extend it to 2022. The rezoning was in the form of a contract, which included conditions for the lighting of the soccer field and the football field. A copy of the contract ordinance (#1896) is attached. One of the conditions specified that the soccer field could be lighted up to 60 nights per year with the lights being turned off by 10:30 each night. At the same time, the Planning staff was charged with drafting a new ordinance to be adopted by the end of 2015 to regulate the lighting of outdoor sports and recreational fields/stadiums city-wide. Ordinance 1896 indicates that if the new ordinance is not in place by December 31, 2015, Kalamazoo College would be able to begin lighting the football field in 2016 for up to 20 nights per year with the lights being turned off by 8:30 each night. As opined by the City Attorney, the new ordinance would not apply to the use of the soccer field or to the tennis facility for the college. It would only apply to the lighting of the football field and its use at night.

As a city-wide ordinance, the new regulations would also apply to any existing or new sports/recreation venue in the city where new lighting systems are being planned over 25 feet tall. It would apply to the potential lighting of the football field or other outdoor sports facilities for Kalamazoo Christian High School. The current lighting regulations in the Zoning Ordinance only address outdoor lights

that are a maximum of 25 feet tall. There are no existing regulations for outdoor stadium, sports field, or recreational facility-type lights that exceed that height.

Community outreach process:

The level of public outreach for the draft ordinance has been extensive. The process was kicked off on March 18, 2015, at a meeting held with the Oakland Drive/Winchell Neighborhood Association (ODWNA). Planning staff introduced the outdoor lighting topic and discussed the need to create the new ordinance. A copy of the public outreach meeting schedule and work plan for the project is attached that indicates numerous community meetings that have been held. In summary, staff attended six neighborhood association meetings including: three at the ODWNA, two at West Main Hill Neighborhood Association (WMHNA), and one at the Stuart Area Restoration Association (SARA) on the proposed lighting ordinance, and hosted three community-wide meetings. During the meetings, staff summarized the research that was conducted and presented other project information, including the draft of the ordinance. The feedback that was obtained from the citizens during the meetings was documented.

A citizen workgroup was formed in May, which met on nine occasions during the course of the project. The workgroup was made up of two members from ODWNA, two members from WMHNA, one member from SARA, two representatives of Kalamazoo College, the athletic director for Kalamazoo Christian Schools, and three Planning staff members. The City Attorney also attended two of the meetings. An outline of the proposed ordinance was formulated by staff and presented to the workgroup in June. A summary of the citizen comments and concerns generated during each of the eighteen public outreach meetings for the project is available.

Research and drafting of the ordinance:

The Planning staff and the citizen workgroup conducted research to identify and evaluate examples of existing outdoor lighting regulations from other communities. The research focused on 35 communities located in Michigan and throughout the country that have lighting regulations in their zoning ordinances. Many of these communities treat new outdoor lighting systems for sports and recreation venues as special uses requiring a special use permit from the Planning Commission. All of them include standards for lighting levels, light pole heights and locations, and timing for use of the lights. Many of the communities also issue various penalties for regulation violations. Staff utilized the most clear, concise, and commonly represented lighting regulation examples to formulate the draft ordinance for Kalamazoo. Following the completion of the research component of the project, the initial draft of the ordinance was created and presented to the citizen workgroup and neighborhoods for review. A summary of the changes from the first draft dated August 26 to present is attached.

Revisions to the draft ordinance:

Many meetings and conversations took place with the citizen workgroup and the public pertaining to the draft ordinance. In response to several of the suggestions and comments provided during the review process, staff made a number of revisions to the original draft of the ordinance to strengthen and clarify the regulations. Each revision was presented to the workgroup and citizens for review. The most notable changes in the language from the original draft to the final draft were as follows:

- Added more restrictive provisions pertaining to the allowed timing and use of the outdoor lights for venues;
- Included an overtime/weather delay provision for use of the outdoor lights;
- Clarified and strengthened the provisions for the rental and third party use of the lighting systems;
- Added the requirement for the owner/operator to provide proposed and actual use schedules for the lights;
- Strengthened requirements to keep noise levels at the venues at reasonable levels to include differences between practices and contests;
- Added a provision that the city could require sound studies be performed during events or practices for venues in response to noise complaints;
- Enhanced the process for addressing violations and drafted an administrative policy for enforcement;
- Added regulations for the repair and maintenance of lighting and public address systems;
- Added the testing of new lighting and public address systems and reporting of the results prior to use; and
- Separated the use table by zoning districts with venues in commercial, manufacturing, and non-educational IC zones treated differently than venues in the educational IC and public zones. Use of outdoor lighting systems is more restrictive in the former zones than the latter zones.

Components of the final draft ordinance:

The final draft ordinance includes the following definition, which is proposed to be added to Chapter 12.3 of the zoning ordinance:

OUTDOOR SPORTS/RECREATION VENUE – All sports fields, stadiums, recreational sports venues, and related facilities utilizing outdoor lighting for nighttime use of the facilities, where proposed light poles or light support structures exceed twenty-five feet in height.

Any such, an existing or planned venue where outdoor lighting is proposed to be taller than twenty-five feet would not be allowed in the residential zoning districts. Such outdoor lighting uses are only allowed in the CN-1, CN-2, CC, CCBD, CMU, M-1, M-2, IC, and P zones with a special use permit from the Planning

Commission. The general use table in Chapter 4.1 of the zoning ordinance and table 3.7-1 of the Riverfront Overlay Zoning District are proposed to be adjusted to reflect the need for a special use permit for the outdoor lighting.

Chapter 8.3 D. of the zoning ordinance specifies the current requirements for obtaining all types of special use permits. Subsection 11 is proposed to be added to the chapter, which provides regulations for special use permits for outdoor sports/recreation venues containing outdoor lighting. A summary of these regulations is as follows:

- a. Illumination levels from outdoor lighting systems cannot exceed 0.05 foot candles as measured at the property boundaries. Flashing lights and search lights are not allowed.
- b. The lighting fixtures must be shielded and angled downward to minimize light spill.
- c. Light poles must be located such that if they fall, they will remain within the boundaries of the property.
- d. Pole height and lighting levels must meet the standards of the Illuminating Engineering Society of North America.
- e. For educational uses (colleges, universities, other schools) in the IC zone, lighting for practices must be turned off by 8:30 p.m. every day, lighting for events held on Sunday through Thursday must be turned off by 8:30 p.m., and lighting for events held on Friday or Saturday must be turned off by 10:30 p.m. For non-educational uses in the IC zone and for all other allowed zones, the lights for all uses must be turned off by 10:30 a.m. every day of the week. All such outdoor lighting cannot be turned on prior to 3:00 p.m. All lighting systems must be recordable for usage. For overtime situations and weather delays during events, the use of the lighting may extend by 60 minutes past the time required.
- f. Night time rentals of outdoor sporting or recreational facilities are allowed for educational uses in the IC zoning district, but only for affiliates of the property owner. For all other allowed zones and uses, night time rental uses are only allowed for the originally intended use of the venue and must be listed in the application for the special use permit.
- g. On a quarterly basis, the owners/operators of outdoor sport/recreation venue lights must provide to the city a proposed use schedule for the lights, and a report on the use of the lights.
- h. Public address systems for outdoor sports/recreation venues must be directed away from residential areas and cannot be used during practices. Sound may be played over public address systems during events. Additional systems for amplified sound are not allowed during practices or events. Non-ambient sound levels must meet current city noise regulations.

- i. Initial violations of the conditions of the ordinance shall be addressed by the City Planner and shall follow the established procedures of Chapter 10 of the zoning ordinance, which allows the issuance of fines and suspensions to the owner/operator of the venue as well as an Administrative Enforcement Policy. In response to noise complaints from operation of a venue, the city may require a noise study be conducted during a practice or event. After a third violation of the ordinance, the issue shall be brought before the Planning Commission, which may suspend or revoke the special use permit.
- j. Normal repair and maintenance of lighting and public address systems is allowed. The replacement of non-conforming systems for an existing lighted facility may occur, but the new system must not increase the non-conformity.
- k. Applications for special use permits for outdoor lighting systems must include information on the proposed use of the venues, photometric plans, light shielding, designs of public address systems, and other information to demonstrate compliance with the ordinance. All such proposed lighting systems shall be reviewed by the Site Plan Review Committee. Following installation, lighting and public address systems shall be tested for compliance with the ordinance.
- l. Table 8.3.2 specifies the number of allowed uses of the lighting systems by proximity to the nearest residential property and by zoning district. As shown in the upper portion of the table, proposed lighting systems that are 700 feet or less from the nearest residential property would not be allowed in the commercial and manufacturing zones, and for non-educational uses in the IC zone. The rationale for this is that most of the uses in these zones would be operated as a business, and greater use of the facilities would be needed for the business to operate. The higher number of uses would have a greater impact on adjacent neighborhoods. Consequently, requiring a significant separation between the lighted venues and residential uses is suggested in these zones. As shown in the lower portion of the table, proposed lighting systems that are 200 feet or less from the nearest residential property would not be allowed for educational uses in the IC zone or the P zone. This includes the current athletic fields for Kalamazoo Christian High School. The football field for Kalamazoo College would be in the second category of this section of the table, and would be allowed to have up to 20 practices using the lights. Two of the practice allowances could be for games/events.

Rationale for the final draft ordinance:

Over the last eight months, the Planning staff has listened to the comments, suggestions and concerns expressed by the workgroup and the citizens on the proposed ordinance. The comments encompassed a wide range of opinion from having no outdoor lighting systems for these venues to allowing unlimited use of

them. Staff has attempted to provide a balanced and reasonable approach to the treatment of outdoor lighting and public address systems in this ordinance, which includes a variety of provisions that will provide protection for the quality of life of the affected property owners. Such protection includes requirements for minimal light spillage from the property, shielded and angled light fixtures, specific timing for use of the lights, minimal third party use, controls on noise levels, reporting for use of the lights, and consequences for violating the provisions of the ordinance.

Educational uses are less intense, for a generally fixed period of time in the year, and are separated out into practices and contests. Practices are not allowed to use public address systems. The number of allowed uses is weighted toward practices and a minimum number of higher impact night contests are allowed. Those venues used primarily for commercial use have been set back a greater distance from residential property lines as they could be year around venues. The night time operation of outdoor sport and recreational facilities unavoidably produces a certain amount of noise and light. This ordinance attempts to reduce the effects of such impacts on the surrounding properties.

It is significantly challenging to reach complete consensus on this type of issue, which includes attempting to meet the diverse needs and desires of a large group of individuals. Although complete consensus on all of the sections of the proposed ordinance was not reached, substantial agreement was obtained on most of the provisions.

RECOMMENDED ACTION

It is recommended that the Planning Commission recommend to the City Commission to approve the text amendment request as presented.

Attachments:

Ordinance
Project work plan
Ordinance 1896
Administrative Enforcement Policy
Summary of ordinance changes
Summary of citizen meetings (to be provided separately)

DRAFT ORDINANCE (10/30/15)

OUTDOOR SPORTS/RECREATION LIGHTING AND NOISE REGULATIONS

Chapter 12.3 Definitions and Use Categories

OUTDOOR SPORTS/RECREATION VENUE – All sports venues, stadiums, recreational sports venues, and related facilities utilizing outdoor lighting for nighttime use of the facilities, where proposed light poles or light support structures exceed twenty-five feet in height.

Chapter 3.7 Riverfront Overlay

Add a note in Table 3.7-1 for the “Entertainment and Sports, Spectator – Limited” category indicating that an outdoor sports/recreation venue requires a special use permit.

Chapter 4.1 Use Regulations

Add a note in the Use Table for the “Entertainment and Sports, Spectator” and “Sports and Recreation, Participant – Outdoor” categories indicating that an outdoor sports/recreation venue requires a special use permit.

Chapter 8.3 D. Special Use Permit

11. Regulations for Outdoor Sports/Recreation Venues

- a) Illumination levels. The light levels from an outdoor sports/ recreation venue lighting source shall not exceed 0.05 foot candles as measured at a height of five feet above the ground surface level at all property lines. Ambient light from sources other than the outdoor sports/recreation venue lighting shall be excluded in determining the foot candle levels at all property lines. No flashing lights or search lights shall be permitted at any time.
- b) Shielding and glare. All outdoor sports/recreation lighting shall include opaque hood shielding (louvers, shields, or similar devices) to direct the illumination downward at no greater than a forty-five degree angle from the pole or other light support structure, and must be aimed so that their beams are directed toward and fall within the playing venue. The shielding design shall incorporate the current lighting standards for controlling light spill and direction at the time of installation and for any replacement or upgrading of the lighting system as defined in subsection j, as established by the Illuminating Engineering Society of North America (IESNA) found in publication “RP-6-15 Sports Lighting: Recommended Practice for Sports and Recreational Area Lighting,” as amended.

- c) Pole location. All light poles or light support structures shall be located a distance from the property lines of the outdoor sports/recreation venue equal to no less than the total height and length of the pole/structure and light fixture.
- d) Pole height and illumination intensity. Outdoor sports/recreation venue light pole heights and lighting levels shall be consistent with the most current standards established by the Illuminating Engineering Society of North America (IESNA) as found in publication “RP-6-15 Sports Lighting: Recommended Practice for Sports and Recreational Area Lighting,” as amended at the time of installation.
- e) Timing for use of lights. The timing and use of outdoor sports/recreation venue lights shall be limited to the times specified in Table 8.3.2. All outdoor sports/recreation venue lighting systems must incorporate a recordable system that can be used to verify when the lights have been turned on and off. Use of the lighting systems for a venue for a sporting/recreational practice shall not extend past the normal required turn off time. The use of the venue lighting systems for a venue for a sporting/recreational event may extend beyond the normal required turn off time for the lights for overtime game or contest situations or weather delays, however the use of the venue lighting systems for such purposes shall not extend more than 60 minutes beyond the required venue lighting shut off time. When an extension of the use of the venue lighting system is necessary, the owner/operator shall immediately notify the Public Safety Department, and shall notify the Community Planning and Development Department the day after the event with a written explanation of the reason for the extended use.
- f) Rental and third party use of outdoor sports and recreation venues.
 - 1) Nighttime rentals or third party use requiring the use of venue lighting of outdoor sports or recreation venues owned by a college, university, or secondary school educational institution in an IC zoning district is prohibited except for an affiliate of the property owner. As used herein, an “affiliate” means another educational institution member in the same athletic league, conference or regulatory body, such as the NCAA or MHSAA, as the property owner.
 - 2) In all other zoning districts, including other non-educational institution uses in the IC zone, nighttime rentals or use of outdoor sports or recreation venues shall only be for the originally intended purpose of the venue as listed in the special use permit application. The total number of uses of the lighting system for a venue for a given year, whether by the owner/operator or other group/individual, may not exceed what is permitted for the site in Table 8.3.2, and must meet all conditions of this ordinance.

- g) Use schedule for lights and reporting. On a quarterly basis, prior to the use of lighting, the proposed use schedule for the outdoor sports/recreation lighting shall be placed on the publicly accessible website of the property owner/operator, be provided to the City of Kalamazoo by the property owner/operator, and distributed by the property owner/operator to all neighborhood associations located within a one-half-mile radius of the venue. On a quarterly basis, the property owner/operator shall provide a written report of the use of the lights to the City of Kalamazoo for the previous quarter, including the level of lighting (high/low) and times the lights were turned on and off for each use.
- h) Noise levels for illuminated outdoor sports/recreation venues. Public address systems shall utilize the best existing sound industry technology available for controlling sound volume, positioning and acoustics, and shall be set to minimize the noise impact on surrounding residences. Any permanently-installed speakers for public address systems for outdoor sports/recreation venues shall be positioned and directed away from adjacent residential areas. For sports/recreation practices, use of the public address systems and amplified music is not allowed. For sports/recreation games and contests, use of the public address system and non-amplified sound is allowed. All non-ambient noise emanating from any other source on the property during sports/recreation events and practices shall not exceed the noise decibel limitations set forth in the Kalamazoo Code of Ordinances. Portable or auxiliary sound systems and/or additional amplified sound shall not be used at any time.
- i) Violations. If any of the above standards are violated at any time and such violation is verified, the City Planner shall issue a written warning to the owner/operator of the venue in accordance with the Community Planning and Development Administrative Enforcement Policy – Enforcement of outdoor Sports/Recreation Lighting and Noise Regulations. In response to noise complaints received from the use of an outdoor sports/recreational venue, the City of Kalamazoo is authorized to require a noise study be conducted during an event/practice/use of the venue by a qualified firm or individual at the expense of the owner/operator. If a second violation of the standards occurs within 12 months of the first violation and is verified, the City Planner shall issue a second written warning to the owner/operator of the venue and shall follow the procedures set forth in Chapter 10 of the Zoning Ordinance pertaining to violations, penalties and enforcement. Penalties shall be commensurate with the severity of the violations. If a third violation occurs within 12 months of the second violation and is verified, the matter shall be brought before the Planning Commission for review. The Planning Commission shall take action to suspend the use of the

outdoor lighting and/or public address system for up to 6 months. If additional violations occur and are verified, the Planning Commission shall take action to suspend the use of the outdoor lighting and/or public address system for up to 12 months, or may revoke the special use permit and terminate use of the lights or public address system.

- j) Repair and maintenance. Normal repair and maintenance of outdoor lighting and public address systems for outdoor sports/recreation venues, such as light bulb or wiring replacement, minor repairs of damage from storms or other events, or minor repairs from normal equipment deterioration, shall be allowed. The replacement or upgrade of an outdoor sports/recreation venue lighting system (poles, light fixtures, or other lighting structure) or to a public address system must comply with the sections (a), (b), (d) and (h) of this ordinance. Such lighting and public address system replacement or upgrade shall not be used until such testing reveals it is in compliance with this ordinance.
- k) Application requirements. In making application for a special use permit under this section, the applicant shall provide written evidence including: a list of the activities that will take place at the lighted venue, photometric plans for the lighting systems, methods used to reduce glare and light spill, design plans for public address and other sound systems, graphic representations, and other support documentation to demonstrate that all of the above conditions will be met. Plans for all such lighting and/or public address systems shall be submitted to the City of Kalamazoo for formal site plan review. After obtaining all necessary city approvals and installing the lighting/public address systems, the owner/operator of the venue shall be required to have the systems tested for compliance with the conditions of this ordinance prior to use. A written report of the results of the tests shall be provided to the City of Kalamazoo. The outdoor sports/recreation venue lighting and public address systems shall not be used until such testing reveals they are in compliance with this ordinance.

Table 8.3.2 Use of Outdoor Sports/Recreation Lighting

Distance from sports/recreation light pole to nearest residential property line:	Zones: CN-1, CN2, CC, CCBD, CMU, M-1, M-2, IC*
	Total Number of Uses Per Year
700 feet or less	None
Between 701 and 1,000 feet	65
Between 1,001 and 1,250 feet	70
1,251 or more feet	Unlimited
Timing for use of lights: (Not Allowed on Before 3PM (All Days))	Lights Off 10:30PM(All Days)

*IC –non-educational uses.

Distance from sports/recreation light pole to nearest residential property line:	Zones: IC** /P	
	Maximum Number of Events***	Total Number of Uses Per Year
	Game/Contest	Practices
200 feet or less	None	None
Between 201 and 500 feet	2	20
Between 501 and 700 feet	10	60
Between 701 and 1,000 feet	20	65
Between 1,001 and 1,250 feet	30	70
1,251 or more feet	Unlimited	
Timing for use of lights: (Not Allowed on Before 3PM (All Days))	Lights Off 8:30PM (Thurs-Sun) 10:30PM (Fri-Sat)	Lights Off 8:30PM (All Days)

** IC = Educational uses i.e. colleges, university, and secondary school uses

***Number of Games/ Contests is part of the total uses and are not counted as additional uses, provided however, in case of conflict between this Table and Ordinance 1896, the latter shall control.

INTER-OFFICEMEMO

To: Rebekah Kik, City Planner
From: Peter C. Eldridge, Project Coordinator **DRAFT**
Date: October 13, 2015
Subject: Administrative Enforcement Policy – Enforcement of the Outdoor Sports/Recreation Lighting and Noise Regulations

Enforcement Powers of City Planner are expressly provided for in Chapter 10 of the Zoning Ordinance:

§ 10.1, Enforcement.

A. City Planner Enforces Ordinance. In accordance with Section 125 of the Michigan City and Village Zoning Act, Pub. Act 207 of 1921, the City Planner shall be responsible for enforcing any provision of this Ordinance:

1. Through the issuance either of a municipal civil infraction violation notice or of a municipal civil infraction citation; or
2. Through the institution of appropriate legal action to prevent, restrain, correct, enjoin or abate any violation of the provisions of this Ordinance; or
3. Through legal action to abate a public or private nuisance.

B. On-Site Inspections Authorized. In any municipal civil infraction action, or any action or proceeding in equity for the violation of any provision of this Ordinance, the City Planner shall have the authority to conduct an on-site inspection of the land where such violation is alleged to have occurred.

§ 10.2, Section F, Types of Violation:

F. Types of Violations. Any of the following shall be a violation of this Ordinance and shall be subject to the remedies and penalties provided for in this Ordinance.

1. Development without permit or approval. To engage in any development, construction, remodeling, alteration, placement of signs, or other activity of any nature upon land that is subject to this Ordinance without all of the approvals required by this Ordinance.
2. Development, use or sign inconsistent with permit or approval. To engage in any development, use, construction, remodeling, or other activity of any nature in any way inconsistent with the terms and conditions of any permit, approved site plan, approval, certificate, or other form of authorization required in order to engage in such activity.
3. Development, use or sign inconsistent with conditions. To violate, by act or omission, any term, condition, or qualification placed upon any permit, approval, or other form of

authorization.

4. Violating dimensional requirements. To reduce or diminish any lot area so that the lot size, setbacks or open spaces shall be smaller than prescribed by this Ordinance or to increase the height or bulk of any building or structure in violation of the requirements of this Ordinance.

5. Increasing intensity or density of use. To increase the intensity or density of use of any land or structure, except in accordance with the procedural requirements and substantive standards of this Ordinance.

6. Removing or defacing required notice. To remove, deface, obscure or otherwise interfere with any notice required by this Ordinance.

7. Failure to remove signs. To fail to remove any sign installed, created, erected or maintained in violation of this Ordinance, or for which the sign permit has lapsed.

8. Obtaining permit or approval in a fraudulent manner. To obtain any permit, approval, certificate, or other form of authorization required by this Ordinance in a fraudulent manner.

9. All other violations. To establish or operate other activities, structures or land uses in violation of any specific provisions, or the general purpose and intent of this Ordinance.

Required Equipment for Enforcement of the Ordinance:

The Outdoor Sports/Recreation Lighting and Noise Regulations include illumination and decibel level standards.

- Illumination levels will be measure with a light meter by the Zoning Staff. The illumination is measured at the property lines in foot-candle units. The measurements must be taken with a light meter at a consistent height of five feet above the ground at all property lines.
- Decibel levels will be measured with a decibel meter by either the Zoning Staff or a Public Safety Officer. Decibel level measurements must also be taken at the property lines. Decibel levels must be consistent with the Kalamazoo Code of Ordinances set forth.

Step 1: Investigation

A violation may be the result of pro-active monitoring by Zoning Staff or a complaint received by C.P. & D. If a citizen complaint is received, all information should be logged on a 'Service Request' form to document background on complaint and contact information for the citizen. All pro-active or complaint-based investigations should be entered into the BS&A database (Building Department.Net) for tracking purposes.

A site inspection may be conducted to view the property and identify the violation(s), if necessary. For time infractions (stadium lighting on early or later than allowed), a request for record of lighting usage

shall be made to the institution in question. The institution must respond within ten days with the requested information or addition enforcement action shall be taken. If light levels at property lines are in question, evening inspections may be necessary to verify light spill.

Decibel measurements should be taken immediately upon receipt of a complaint, at no closer than 100 feet of the venue, by the Zoning Staff or a Public Safety Officer. If no immediate measurement of noise level is possible, the Ordinance provides that City Planner has the authority to require the institution in question to conduct a noise study of the facility during an event/practice/use of the facility by a qualified firm or individual at the expense of the owner. Submittal of this report to the City Planner upon completion is required.

At the conclusion of the investigation phase if no violation is evident the Zoning Staff will proceed with a staff report acknowledging the case and archived in the database.

If a zoning violation is verified, evidence of the violations shall be forwarded to the City Planner for action:

Step 2: Violation Types:

Determine classification of violation types below:

Minor Violations:

Major Violations:

Lights are left on less than 30 minutes over end of permitted use	Lights are left on more than 30 minutes over end of permitted use
Use of public address systems and/or non-amplified music during sports/recreation practices.	Noise during practice time is excessive and amplified; Noise during a game/contest is excessive and amplified with multiple systems.
Lights are turned on before 3 PM on any day.	Lights are used over the permitted use allotment.
Failure to submit quarterly use schedule, provide schedule to neighborhood associations or post on website.	Illumination level at property lines exceeds .05 foot candles above ambient light.
Failure to provide a written report of the use of the lights to the City of Kalamazoo for the previous quarter, including the times the lights were turned on and off for each use.	Rental to third party groups not affiliated with institution.

With the exception of spectator noise, use of PA and non-amplified music any non-ambient noise emanating from any other source during sports/recreation event which exceeds the noise decibel limitations.	Use of portable or auxiliary sound systems and/or additional amplified music shall not be used at any time

Step 3: Enforcement Action:

Results of investigation shall be reported to the City Planner to take enforcement action. Per the Outdoor Sports/Recreation Lighting and Noise Regulations, the City Planner shall take the following steps:

First Offense: If any of the above standards are violated at any time and such violation is verified, the City Planner shall issue a written warning to the owner/operator of the venue and an invoice for the appropriate cost recovery charge(s) shall be sent.

Second Offense: If a second violation occurs within 12 months of the first violation and is verified, the enforced shall depend on the severity of the violation. City Planner shall reduce the allowed number of lighting uses approved for the facility by minimum of one (1) use for a ‘Minor Violation’ and a minimum of two (2) uses for a ‘Major Violation’ and/or the issuance of a municipal civil infraction citation. Additionally, an invoice for the appropriate cost recovery charge(s) shall be sent.

Third Offense: If a third violation occurs within a 12 month period and is verified the matter shall be brought before the Planning Commission for review. The Planning Commission shall take action to suspend the use of the outdoor lighting and/or public address system for up to 6 months. If additional violations occur and are verified, the Planning Commission shall take action to suspend the use of the outdoor lighting and/or public address system for up to 12 months, or may revoke the special use permit and terminate use of the lights or public address system.

Municipal Civil Infraction Citations. The City Planner may also authorize the issuance of municipal civil infraction citations. Per Chapter 10.3, Section A, Any person, corporation, firm or partnership, or anyone acting on behalf of any person, corporation, firm or partnership, who admits

responsibility or is found to be responsible through a municipal civil infraction determination for violation of any provision of this Ordinance shall be fined up to \$500 for each day of the violation pursuant to § 10.2H: Continuing Violations.

Attachments:

DRAFT

Summary of Ordinance Changes from 8/26 Draft to Present

1. Definitions: Entertainment has been removed throughout the ordinance; Recreation is defined as a sports complex or venue, not an entertainment or music venue.
2. a) Foot candles are changed to 0.05 from 0.1 and then back to .05
3. b) Most advanced technology in Illumination is changed to “current industry standards”
4. c) Language changed to clarify how the pole and light fixture heights were measured: “equal to no less than the total height and length of the pole/structure and light fixture.”
5. d) Language changed from most current technology to:” shall be consistent with the most current standards.”
6. e) Timing and the use section has been changed to: incorporate a recordable system that can be used to verify light usage; an overtime/ weather extension provision was added for 60 minutes beyond the required venue lighting shut off.
7. f) Clarification was added for all nighttime rentals involving lighted use: must be consistent with the type of use specified in the application process; must be affiliated with the educational entity in an IC zone owner/operator; affiliate was defined; all other zoning uses are held to the originally intended purpose of the venue as listed in the special use permit application.
8. g) Game/ contest schedule was changed from yearly to: must be submitted by the owner/ operator quarterly; the owner/ operator shall provide the schedule to all neighborhood associations located within one-half mile radius of the venue and place a copy on a publicly accessible website; in addition “look back” schedules shall be provided.
9. h) Most advanced technology in sound equipment is changed to “current industry standard”; positioning and acoustics shall be set to minimize noise impact on surrounding residences; Sports and recreation practices shall not use the public address system.
10. i) Violations language: Changed all enforcement language from may to shall; If the venue has noise complaints the owner/operator shall be requested to conduct a study during use at the expense of the owner/ operator; a written warning to the owner/ operator of the venue in accordance with the Community Planning and Development Administrative Enforcement Policy – Enforcement of outdoor Sports/Recreation Lighting and Noise Regulations.
11. j) The replacement or upgrade of an outdoor sports/recreation venue lighting system (poles, light fixtures, or other lighting structure) or to a public address system must comply with the sections (a), (b), (d) and (h) of this ordinance.
12. k) Language has been added throughout the process to include: design plans for the public address systems; Formal site plan review; A written report of the results of the tests shall be provided to the City of Kalamazoo. The outdoor sports/recreation venue lighting and public address systems shall not be used until such testing reveals they are in compliance with this ordinance.

13. Table 8.3.2: Table has been separated into two distinct zoning categories – educational and other zones. Table that reflects educational uses are able to be closer to residential zoning and have two categories: practices and games. Time tables reflect the differences in shut off and days that they can be used. Other uses zoning table reflects a change in distance to residential beginning at 700 feet.

Sports Field Lighting Ordinance 2015 Work plan

Introduce Sports Field lighting ordinance topic to neighborhoods and Planning Commission

- Meet with ODWNA March 18
- Meet with W. Main Hill N.A. March 31
- Meet with K College staff April 1
- Second meet with W. Main Hill N.A. April 14
- Measure K soccer field light levels April 15

March - April

Introduce lighting ordinance topic
 Introduce lighting ordinance topic
 Introduce lighting ordinance topic
 Discuss planned ord.
 Summary report

Research of model lighting ordinances for standards from other communities

- Begin research on lighting regulations May 4
- First meet. of research workgroup May 19
- 2 meet. of research workgroup June 9
- W.E Upjohn study on economic impacts June 16
- 3 meeting of research workgroup July 9

May - July

Research regulations from other communities
 Discuss research process and initial results
 Research presented
 Initial rpt. of results
 Present draft of ord. outline

Present outline of the ordinance based on the research of ordinances and feedback sessions

- 4 Research workgroup Meeting August 18
- First Community meeting August 26

August

Draft ordinance presented
 Draft ordinance presented

Provide a draft of the ordinance to go out to the neighborhoods

- 5 Research workgroup meeting September 8
- Meet with ODWNA September 16
- 6 Research workgroup meeting September 21
- Second community meeting September 23
- Third meeting with W. Main Hill N.A. September 29

August –September

Provide a revised draft of the ordinance for citizen review

October - November

- 7 Research workgroup meeting October 6
- Meet with Stuart Neighborhood October 13
- 8 Research workgroup meeting October 21
- Third community meeting October 22
- 9 Research workgroup meeting October 27

Final Ordinance goes to the Planning Commission and City Commission – Public hearings

November- December

- Planning Commission hearing November 5
- City Commission hearing December 7 & 21

**CITY OF KALAMAZOO
SITE PLAN REVIEW PROJECT LIST**

print date: 10/30/2015

Year 2015	Project Address	Project Description	Applicant	Date Received	Comments Due Date	1st Review Date	Final Approval Date	Comments	Fee Paid	Status	Insp.	Trees/Shrubs	Final Inspect.
2015.54	Willard Street	New trail segment	City of Kalamazoo - Public Services	10/28/2015	11/4/2015	Staff review	--	Under review	N/A	O	Bobby		
2015.53	2634 Mt. Olivet Road	Add equipment to water tank	Verizon Wireless	10/27/2015	11/10/2015	Staff review	--	Under review	\$376.00	O	Bobby		
2015.52	1233 Edgemoor	Add equipment to water tank	Verizon Wireless	10/27/2015	11/10/2015	Staff review	--	Under review	\$376.00	O	Bobby		
2015.51	3427 Gull Road	New Nazareth Center	Congregation of St. Joseph	10/20/2015	11/2/2015	11/3/2015	--	Under review		O	Bobby		
2015.5	401 Howard Street	Building addition	Kalamazoo Clinical	10/20/2015	11/2/2015	11/3/2015	--	Under review		O	Bobby		
2015.49	3600 Covington Road	New brewery and pub	Land One, LLC	10/13/2015	10/26/2015	10/27/2015	--	Under review	\$419.00	O	Bobby		
2015.48	1201 Kimbark	Two new duplexes	Greg Watts	10/13/2015	10/26/2015	10/27/2015	--	Under review		O	Bobby		
2015.47	2914 Portage Street	Parking lot use for restaurant	El Gallo Blanco Restaurant	10/7/2015	10/21/2015	10/22/2015	10/26/2015	Final approval provided	N/A	X	Bobby	23 shrubs	
2015.46	1608 Lake Street	Building addition	Family and Children Services	10/6/2015	10/19/2015	10/20/2015	--	Under review		O	Bobby		
2015.45	1500 Lamont	New pole barn	Kalamazoo County Jail	10/5/2015	10/19/2015	10/20/2015	10/22/2015	Final approval provided	N/A	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.44	3057 Gull Road	New storage building	Borgess Gardens	9/25/2015	10/12/2015	10/13/2015	10/22/2015	Final approval provided	\$188.00	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.43	1802 Tray Lane	New storage building	Americana Estates	9/25/2015	10/12/2015	10/13/2015	10/23/2015	Final approval provided	\$188.00	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.42	611 Whites Road	New garage building	Regency Square Apartments	9/22/2015	10/5/2015	10/6/2015	10/23/2015	Final approval provided	\$188.00	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.41	618 E. Michigan Avenue	Change use to distillery	Distilled Kalamazoo	9/22/2015	10/5/2015	10/6/2015	--	Under review	N/A	O	Bobby		
2015.4	104 W. Cork Street	Two building additions	Southwest Michigan Emergency Hospital	9/15/2015	9/28/2015	9/29/2015	10/15/2015	Final approval provided	\$336.91	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.39	421-427 E. Michigan	Building addition	Depot Building	9/15/2015	9/28/2015	9/29/2015	10/29/2015	Final approval provided	\$367.40	X	Bobby	12 trees, 56 shrubs	
2015.38	219 W. South Street	Architectural changes	The Park Club	9/10/2015	--	Staff review	9/14/2015	Final approval provided	N/A	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.37	3706 Mt. Olivet Road	Building addition	Temple Baptist Church	8/25/2015	9/7/2015	9/8/2015	9/18/2015	Final approval provided	\$188.00	X	Bobby	5 shrubs	
2015.36	131 Catherine	Fitness and wellness center	Kalamazoo College	8/25/2015	9/7/2015	9/8/2015	10/1/2015	Final approval provided	\$539.00	X	Bobby	9 trees, 47 shrubs	
2015.35	100 Monroe Street	Add parking spaces	Henderson Castle	8/20/2015	9/2/2015	9/3/2015	9/14/2015	Final approval provided	N/A	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.34	423-429 E. North Street	Change use to distillery	Green Door Distilling Company	8/11/2015	8/24/2015	8/25/2015	9/28/2015	Final approval provided	N/A	X	Bobby	15 shrubs	
2015.33	1516 Rockledge	Add equipment to cell tower	AT&T Mobility	8/11/2015	8/25/2015	Staff review	8/31/2015	Final approval provided	\$376.00	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.32	709 Second Street	Use change to auto sales	Robison Auto	7/30/2015	8/12/2015	8/13/2015	--	Under review	N/A	O	Bobby		
2015.31	3620 Jay Drive	New garage building	Twin Leaf mobile home park	7/28/2015	8/10/2015	8/11/2015	8/13/2015	Final approval provided	\$188.00	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.3	817 W. Kilgore Road	Add antennas to cell tower	AT&T Mobility	7/17/2015	7/30/2015	Staff review	8/6/2015	Final approval provided	\$376.00	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.29	335 W. Kalamazoo	Temporary parking lot	West Michigan Cancer Center	11/14/2014	--	Staff review	11/14/2014	Final approval provided	N/A	X	Bobby	6 trees, 33 shrubs	8/31/2015
2015.28	590 W. Maple Street	Add antennas to cell tower	AT&T Mobility	7/9/2015	7/23/2015	Staff review	8/6/2015	Final approval provided	\$376.00	X	Bobby	N/A	
2015.27	500 N. Edwards Street	New building	Ministry with Community	6/16/2015	6/29/2015	6/30/2015	8/28/2015	Final approval provided	\$611.00	X	Bobby	39 trees, 260 shrubs	
2015.26	2600 W. Michigan Avenue	New CVS Pharmacy	Velmeir Companies	6/11/2015	6/24/2015	6/25/2015	8/10/2015	Final approval provided	\$481.70	X	Bobby	8 trees, 171 shrubs	
2015.25	3811-3817 S. Westnedge Avenue	New restaurant	Omni Outlook, LLC	6/4/2015	6/17/2015	6/18/2015	7/1/2015	Final approval provided	\$359.00	X	Bobby	9 trees, 27 shrubs	

